

ORR Tram Summit

22 January 2018

11:00-16:00

Holiday Inn, Manchester

Opening comments - Ian Prosser (ORR)

Ian Prosser (IP) identified recommendation 2 as being the key recommendation in the report and crucial to the successful implementation of many of the other recommendations. Implementation of some of the other recommendations would follow recommendation 2, but some of them could be addressed in parallel.

IP emphasised the importance of commitment from all parties and a willingness to work collaboratively to improve understanding of risk.

DfT view – Steve Berry (DfT)

Steve Berry (SB) reiterated the importance of a collaborative approach by the tram industry to addressing the recommendations.

Learning the lessons from Sandilands and making progress with the recommendations is considered a priority by Jesse Norman, Minister for Rail and the establishment of a 'Safety Board' would be an important step in achieving it. Any actions taken should be mindful of the ongoing investigations being carried out by BTP and ORR.

System risk analysis

UK Tram sub-committee 1 – James Hammett (UK Tram)

UK Tram sub-committee 1 had been established immediately after the Sandilands incident and peer reviewed the actions taken by TfL/TOL.

There were human factors issues that needed addressing by industry, in addition to speed reduction and controls that had been more clearly identified by RAIB in their report.

UK Tram had circulated a questionnaire to industry to identify views and issues.

Driver monitoring and in-cab systems were more complex and different options were being investigated. No simple 'plug and play' solutions. Solutions may not be the same for all systems. JHa emphasized the difference between networks, such as the vehicles used and the type of running – on street, segregated etc.

Signage and step down speeds had been introduced on many systems, partly in response to the RAIB Urgent Safety Advice.

RSSB: robust and targeted risk management (George Bearfield)

GB provided some background information on the establishment of RSSB following mainline accidents in the 1980's and 1990's. Many of RSSB's functions have synergies with the issues identified at Sandilands in the RAIB report.

A collaborative approach by duty holders is critical to addressing systemic issues.

Discussion

Jeremy Hotchkiss (JHo) emphasized the need for good data and good analysis to deliver rec 2. How effective is occurrence reporting and data capture and analysis across the tram industry at present?

Colin Kerr (CK) thought most tram systems would have good internal data and analysis, but there was work to be done developing a cross-industry dataset.

JHa mentioned the difficulties around collaboration regarding commercial confidentiality. The tram accident database was still being developed.

IP sees the sharing of risk models and peer reviewing as important and a possible step in developing a generic risk model.

GB – risk models are useful, but are only part of a risk based approach based on local knowledge and a global perspective. The competence of the staff using the risk model was also an important consideration.

Aline Frantzen (AF) – urgent need to benchmark safety management systems, but not clear how to do it.

Mike Mabey (MM) – need for more open discussion with other operators and sharing of best practice through UK Tram working groups. Commercial considerations need to be put in context.

GB – a 'just culture' should enable learning from poor practice as well as sharing of good practice.

Martin Jones (MJ) – what are the barrier to more sharing and how can they be addressed?

Steve Duckering (SD) – transparent sharing of information may give a clearer picture of what is needed for future concession bids.

Carol Mason (CM) – standards give clarity in certain areas and prevent 'drift'. It may be better to restrict standards to safety critical areas.

Geoff Inskip (GI) – resource and capacity may not be the most important issues, but actually the level of cooperation and consistency of feedback from UK Tram forums. LREG/LROC were useful forums, but may be too informal and may benefit from being more structured.

Michael Powell (MP) – using the incident database as an example, work was done, but didn't have the right level of support from industry, so progress was limited.

Safety and standards body options

Discussion

GI – need for a ‘shadow’ steering group to start assessing the different options. Neutral on if it will be part of UK Tram, RSSB or a new organisation. Making a recommendation on that decision will be part of the groups remit.

Mark Phillips (MP) – when RSSB was set a conscious decision was made to keep it separate from the industry body (ATOC).

AF – noted that without a presentation from RSSB it was difficult to compare what they could offer with the UK Tram proposal.

SB – liaising with DfT finance team about providing some funding for the organisation.

It was agreed that the steering group should be made up from owners, operators, ORR and DfT. Nominations would be made to UK Tram by 31 January 2018.

GI confirmed that the shadow steering board would not rule out RSSB.

TOL feedback

JT emphasised the collaboration that had taken place between TOL and TfL and reflected on their joint safety improvement plan.

Guardian machine had been simple and effective and had additional benefit of improving driver posture.

Recommendation 15 had led to improved sharing of data between parties.

Controls and mitigations

IP emphasised the importance of reasonable practicability when addressing these recommendations.

Regulatory approach

All tram operators seem to have good internal systems for reporting but not sharing.

Agreed points

- Chief Inspector has given clear direction of what is expected.
- DfT is making a submission to Ministers about progress.
- Agreement is to form a steering group to consider options of where a SSB might be placed in future, whilst working concurrently on Rec.2
- Nominations for steering group membership by Wed 31 Jan 18 to UK Tram. UK Tram will circulate a draft remit for the steering group. First meeting in mid-Feb 18.
- Nominations should be balanced bringing representation from owners, operators, regulator, DfT, tram constructors etc.

Annex A – list of attendees

Forename	Surname	Organisation
Chris	Davies	Blackpool Transport Services Ltd
Ian	Middlemiss	Blackpool Transport Services Ltd
Steve	Berry	Department for Transport
Jeremy	Hotchkiss	Department for Transport
Alexis	Tregenta	Department for Transport
Colin	Kerr	Edinburgh Trams
Michael	Powell	Edinburgh Trams
Aline	Frantzen	Manchester Metrolink
Helen	Goulding	Manchester Metrolink
Carol	Mason	Manchester Metrolink
Anthony	Stanley	National Express Midland Metro
Mike	Mabey	Nottingham Trams
Simon	Belgard	ORR
Chris	Goodlad	ORR
Martin	Jones	ORR
Ian	Prosser	ORR
Mouli	Rahman	ORR
Ian	Raxton	ORR
Johnny	Schute	ORR
Oliver	Stewart	ORR
George	Bearfield	RSSB
Mark	Phillips	RSSB
Christopher	Hopkinson	South Yorkshire Passenger Transport Executive
Tim	Bilby	Stagecoach Supertram
Chris	Lewis	Stagecoach Supertram
Steve	Duckering	Tram Operations Ltd
Jackie	Townsend	Tram Operations Ltd
Andy	Wallace	Tram Operations Ltd
Chris	Thorpe	Transport for Greater Manchester
Danny	Vaughan	Transport for Greater Manchester
Peter	Howarth	Transport for London
Rob	Maer	Transport for London
Rory	O'Neill	Transport for London
Phil	Hewitt	Transport for West Midlands
Luke	Albanese	UK Tram
Peter	Cushing	UK Tram
James	Hammett	UK Tram
Geoff	Inskip	UK Tram
David	Keay	UK Tram

